

OSHPD Office of Statewide Health Planning and Development

Healthcare Workforce Development Division

2020 West El Camino Avenue, Suite 1222

Sacramento, CA 95833

(916) 326-3700

(916) 322-2588 Fax

www.oshpd.ca.gov



**June 24, 2020 and June 25, 2020
Meeting Minutes**

CALIFORNIA HEALTHCARE WORKFORCE POLICY COMMISSION (Commission)

Policy Meeting

Location:

Due to the COVID-19 emergency, this meeting was held by teleconference and webinar only. Members of the Commission and members of the public participated from their own location via WebEx.

Commission Members Present:

William Henning, DO, Chair
Elizabeth Dolezal, Vice-Chair
Rosslyn S. Byous, DPA, PA-C
Jasmeet K. Bains, MD
Sandra Baker, DNP, RN, CNE, ANEF
Maria Dorado, RN
Katherine Flores, MD
Susan Foster, MSN, FNP-BC
William Henning, DO
Catherine Kennedy, RN
Gregory Knoll, ESQ
Angelica Millan, DNP, RN, FAAN
Deanna Stover, PhD, RN
Debra Sung, MSPT
Joseph Provenzano, DO

Staff to Commission:

Melissa Omand, Program Manager

Additional OSHPD Staff:

Hovik Khosrovian
Ross Lallian
Evan Wallis
Geoffrey Trautman

Commission Members Not in Attendance:

Katherine Kennedy, RN

OSHPD Acting Director

Marko Mijic

Executive Secretary

C.J. Howard

AGENDA ITEM 1: Call to Order

Chair Henning called the meeting to order at 9:03 a.m.

AGENDA ITEM 2: Oath of Office-New Commissioner

Geoffrey Trautman, OSHPD Attorney, administered the Oath of Office to new Commissioner Maria Dorado.

AGENDA ITEM 3: Introduction of Commission Members and Statements of Recusal

Commission members introduced themselves, indicated whom they represent, and their appointing authority. There were no recusals.

AGENDA ITEM 4: Chair's Remarks

Chair Henning reminded the Commissioners of the Song-Brown mission and the importance of these meetings. He also provided instructions for navigating the virtual meeting.

AGENDA ITEM 5: OSHPD Director's Report

C.J. Howard, indicated the acting director will not attend the meeting.

AGENDA ITEM 6: Executive Secretary's Report

C.J. Howard reported on statewide COVID-19 testing efforts, OSHPD, and HWDD program activities, and Song-Brown funding. He addressed the status of the 2020 Budget Act and informed the Commission that Song-Brown funding levels have been maintained, noting that could change in August.

Commission requested that C.J. Howard provide an update when the Governor signs the revised budget.

AGENDA ITEM 7: Approval of March 11, 2020 Minutes

Commission reviewed and approved the March 11, 2020 meeting minutes.

ACTION ITEM

Motion to approve March 11, meeting minutes (Flores), Second (Stover). Motion adopted.

[The March 11, 2020 Meeting Minutes are hereby incorporated as Attachment A.](#)

AGENDA ITEM 8: Correspondence

Chair Henning, presented a letter from Dr. Hector Flores, Chair, Department of Family Medicine, Adventist Health, White Memorial Hospital. The letter requested that the Commission write a letter to CEOs of California philanthropies and encourage them to consider funding health professions pipeline programs.

Geoffrey Trautman informed the Commission that advocating on behalf of third parties is outside the scope of Commission responsibilities.

Commission requested that HWDD staff research the viability of mailing the Song-Brown Healthcare Workforce Training Program Flyer (aka Outcomes Measures Flyer) and other information to foundations and other stakeholders about the work of the Song-Brown Program.

[The letter from Dr. Flores is hereby incorporated as Attachment B.](#)

AGENDA ITEM 9: Primary Care Residency (PCR) Program Review

Hovik Khosrovian, HWDD Policy Section Manager, presented Sjoberg Evanshenk's (Contractor) PCR Program Review findings and recommendations. He also provided updates on the PCR Program Review Subcommittee activities, progress on addressing recommendations, and future agenda items.

[The Primary Care Residency \(PCR\) Program Review presentation is hereby incorporated as Attachment C.](#)

HWDD staff presented Informational updates on:

a. Outcome Measures

Ross Lallian, HWDD Research Manager, presented the Song-Brown Outcomes Flyer. The flyer highlights the impact of Song-Brown PCR Program funding since 2017.

[The Outcome Measures Flyer is hereby incorporated as Attachment D.](#)

b. Environmentally Disadvantaged Data Collection

Hovik Khosrovian updated the Commission on a change to the 2020 PCR application to collect environmentally disadvantaged data. HWDD will report the results at the 2022 PCR Policy Meeting.

[The Environmentally Disadvantaged Data Collection presentation is hereby incorporated as Attachment E.](#)

HWDD presented on:

c. Evaluation Criteria Related to Training Site Data

Hovik Khosrovian presented the Contractor's findings and subcommittee recommendations to address inconsistent program reporting of training sites

Commission requested that HWDD staff prepare a data analysis to determine if training sites can be ranked by volume of time spent and present this analysis at the September 2020 PCR funding meeting.

PUBLIC COMMENT

- Appreciate a methodology that works between disciplines and the alignment of criteria with Accreditation Council for Graduate Medical Education requirements.
- Recommendation to further evaluate training site data and discuss during September 2020 or November 2020 funding meetings.
- Appreciate the work that has been done and supports more evaluation and discussion.
- Recommend narrowing down training sites to where the most care is provided.

ACTION ITEM

Motion to approve revising Criterion 1.1 (Stover), Second (Flores). Motion adopted.

[The Evaluation Criteria Related to Training Site Data presentation is hereby incorporated as Attachment F.](#)

d. Clarification of Payer Mix Data Collection

Hovik Khosrovian presented the PCR Program Review subcommittee recommendation to update the definition of payer mix to "unique patients".

Commission requested HWDD staff add "unduplicated" to the definition of payer mix.

PUBLIC COMMENT

- Support changing the definition of payer mix as discussed.

ACTION ITEM

Motion to adopt the definition as modified (Flores), Second (Stover). Motion adopted.

[The Clarification of Payer Mix Data Collection presentation is hereby incorporated as Attachment G.](#)

e. Treatment of Existing Program Applicants Without Graduate Data

Ross Lallian presented an analysis on the impact of using an alternative scoring methodology for newer PCR programs that do not have complete graduate data. Commissioners discussed and agreed to retain the current scoring methodology.

Commission requested HWDD staff to identify other alternatives to present at a future meeting.

PUBLIC COMMENT

- Support Commission's requests to identify other alternative methodologies.
- Support evaluating other methodologies to address incomplete graduate data.
- Recommend establishing separate funding streams for new programs in their first three to five years, and evaluate on incremental data.

[The Treatment of Existing Program Applicants without Graduate Data presentation is hereby incorporated as Attachment H.](#)

f. Contract Criteria

Melissa Omand reviewed proposed updates and presented considerations for the Song-Brown PCR Program contract criteria.

Commission requested HWDD staff provide additional information at the September 2020 PCR funding meeting about how programs use Song-Brown funds, such as program expenditures and activities,.

PUBLIC COMMENT

- Appreciate efforts to review and update contract criteria.
- Support specifying how funds can be used by programs.
- Recommend the Commission support the updates as it provides more guidance and oversight while maintaining flexibility.

ACTION ITEM

Motion to approve updates to Song-Brown contract criteria (Flores), Second (Provezano). Motion adopted.

[Updates to contract criteria are hereby incorporated as Attachment I.](#)

g. Updates to Standards and Guidelines

Melissa Omand reviewed proposed updates and presented three considerations regarding PCR Standards and Guidelines. Commissioners discussed the updates and agreed to all changes.

Commission asked HWDD staff to research the enforceability of guidelines and present an update at the September 2020 PCR funding meeting.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ACTION ITEM

Motion to approve updates to Standards and Guidelines (Provenzano), Second (Knoll). Motion adopted.

[The updates to Standards and Guidelines are hereby incorporated as Attachment J.](#)

h. Identification of Future Meeting items

Hovik Khosrovian reviewed the three remaining PCR Program Review recommendations and offered a timeline for discussion. Commission requested that HWDD staff prioritize and schedule a call to discuss with the Chair and Vice-Chair.

PUBLIC COMMENT

- Support evaluating scoring to prioritize Underrepresented Minority (URM) residents over URM graduates.

[The Identification of Future Meeting Items presentation is hereby incorporated as Attachment K.](#)

AGENDA ITEM 10: PCR Comprehensive Policy Review

Hovik Khosrovian presented the schedule for conducting comprehensive and abbreviated PCR policy reviews. He also presented potential discussion items for future meetings.

PUBLIC COMMENT

- Important to narrow the definition for practicing primary care five years post-residency, as it may mitigate the maldistribution of specialty care.

[The PCR Comprehensive Policy Review presentation is hereby incorporated as Attachment L.](#)

a. The Topic that Selected Programs will Present for the Next Three Years

Hovik Khosrovian reviewed the current topic for PCR program presentations and offered considerations for future topics. Commissioners discussed and identified

their top two topics, Mental Health and Team Culture. Commission will discuss the at the September 2020 PCR funding meeting.

PUBLIC COMMENT

- Offer to provide Commissioners with additional residency program information.
- Offer to leverage relationship with community health centers to facilitate a discussion on presentation topics.

ACTION ITEM

Motion to approve the topics of Mental Health and Team Culture that programs will present for the next three years (Henning), Second (Stover) . Motion adopted.

[The Topic that Selected Programs will Present for the Next 3 Years presentation is hereby Incorporated as Attachment M.](#)

b. The Criteria for Selecting Presenters at Funding Meetings

Hovik Khosrovian provided background and the options to modify the presenter selection process. Commissioners discussed the options and agreed that HWDD staff will select presenters using Commission's criteria.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ACTION ITEM

Motion to approve the option for HWDD staff to select the presenters using Commission's criteria (Stover), Second (Millan). Motion adopted.

[The Criteria for Selecting Presenters at Funding Meetings presentation is hereby incorporated as Attachment N.](#)

c. PCR Evaluation Criterion 2.2 (practicing primary care five years post residency)

Ross Lallian presented an analysis on the impact of increasing available points for Criterion 2.2 from 15 to 20 and three considerations. Commission discussed and agreed that increasing the points will support primary care programs that focus on family medicine.

Commission requested HWDD staff to discuss how primary care is integrated into the scoring criteria at a future funding meeting.

PUBLIC COMMENT

- Increasing points sends a message that the focus is on family medicine programs and will help identify those programs who truly practice primary care.
- Support continued conversation to modify application criteria to narrow down those programs that focus on family medicine programs.

ACTION ITEM

Motion to approve the increase to the Criterion 2.2 point value from 15 to 20 points (Flores), Second (Bains). Motion adopted.

[The PCR Evaluation Criterion 2.2 \(practicing primary care five years post residency\) presentation is hereby Incorporated as Attachment O.](#)

d. Allocation of Funding for Teaching Health Centers

Hovik Khosrovian presented on the Teaching Health Center (THC) funding allocation and considerations for future funding decisions. He provided several scenarios that showed the impacts of adjusting funding awards and slot caps based on 2019 data.

Commission requested HWDD staff to prepare additional analysis to discuss allocation of future funding at the September 2020 PCR funding meeting.

PUBLIC COMMENT

- Song-Brown funding for THC's is critical. Encourage maintaining current funding levels.
- Federal funding of THC's runs out in November. THC's have expressed willingness to be flexible with adjusting funding and capping slots.
- Support moving a decision to the September 2020 PCR funding meeting.
- Concern that capping award at \$125,000 per slot may not fund all program requests.
- New THC programs train up to six residents and a lower funding amount is better than a slot cap.
- Agree it is better to lower funding than to cap slots.
- Institutions with struggling THC's are dependent on Song-Brown funding and it is important that all programs receive some money this year.
- Minimize decisions that would have a significant change to THC funding and to maintain maximum funding levels.
- Support five slots at \$125,000 per slot as this allows new THC programs to be funded during the next funding cycle.

ACTION ITEM

Motion to request that HWDD staff present impacts of capping slots and alternatives for future funding at September 2020 PCR funding meeting (Stover), second (Flores).

[The Allocation of Funding for Teaching Health Centers presentation is hereby incorporated as Attachment P.](#)

AGENDA ITEM 11: Data Fund Allocation for PCR and Family Nurse Practitioner/Physician Assistants (FNP/PA)

Hovik Khosrovian presented on the Data Fund distribution for PCR and FNP/PA and presented considerations.

Commissioners discussed and agreed to delay a decision due to the uncertainty of the 2020 Budget Act until the September 2020 funding meeting.

PUBLIC COMMENT

- Song-Brown funding has fluctuated over the years and funding moves between Data Fund and General Fund.
- Recommends that the Commission postpone making any changes to the PCR and FNP/PA allocation.
- Supports postponing a change until after August when the Governor signs the 2020 Budget Act.

[The Data Fund Allocation for PCR and Family Nurse Practitioner/Physician Assistants \(FNP/PA\) is hereby incorporated as Attachment Q.](#)

AGENDA ITEM 12: Severity of Areas of Unmet Need (AUN)

Courtney Ackerman, Research Data Specialist, presented an analysis on the Severity of AUN and scoring considerations.

Commission requested that HWDD staff prepare an analysis of time spent at training sites to present at the January 2021 RN Funding Meeting.

PUBLIC COMMENT

- Appreciate the detailed analysis.
- Recommend that Commission postpone a decision until September 2020 funding meeting to allow time for additional analysis based on the changes to the payer mix definition and change to Criterion 1.1 Training Sites.

ACTION ITEM

Motion to adopt bonus point methodology as presented for graduate data only (Bains), second (Millan). Motion adopted.

[The Severity of Areas of Unmet Need \(AUN\) presentation is hereby incorporated as Attachment R.](#)

AGENDA ITEM 13: Abbreviated Policy Review for Registered Nurse (RN) and FNP/PA

a. Schedule for Conducting RN and FNP/PA Comprehensive Policy Reviews

Hovik Khosrovian presented the comprehensive policy review schedule for each discipline. Commission discussed the current schedule and considerations to revise the schedule.

Commissioner's Baker and Stover agreed to participate in an RN Comprehensive Policy Review Subcommittee. Commission requested subcommittee present their recommendations for the scope of the RN review at the September 2020 funding meeting.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ACTION ITEM

Motion to approve changing the RN comprehensive policy review to FY 2020-21 and FNP/PA comprehensive policy review to 2021-22, (Stover), second (Baker). Motion adopted.

[The Schedule for Conducting RN and FNP/PA Comprehensive Policy Reviews is hereby Incorporated as Attachment S.](#)

b. RNSA Designation Methodology

Evan Wallis, Research Data Specialist, presented an analysis of RN shortage areas and four subcommittee recommendations. Commission discussed and agreed to three of the four recommendations.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

ACTION ITEM

Motion to approve the designation frequency as proposed (Baker), second (Knoll). Motion adopted.

Motion to approve the fixed shortage definition as proposed and integrate severity into existing scoring (Baker), second (Knoll). Motion adopted.

Motion to approve custom geography (Stover), second (Sung). Motion adopted.

[The RNSA Designation Methodology presentation is hereby incorporated as Attachment T.](#)

AGENDA ITEM 14: Update of Commission Policies and Procedures

Melissa Omand presented updates to Commission Policies and Procedures and proposed three changes. Commission discussed the proposed updates to the Policies and Procedures.

PUBLIC COMMENT

- Recommendation to use strikethrough/underline in future documents.

ACTION ITEM

Motion to approve the changes as proposed (Stover), second (Millan). Motion adopted.

[The update of Commission Policies and Procedures is hereby incorporated as Attachment U.](#)

AGENDA ITEM 15: Workforce Education and Training Programs (WET) Update

Anne Powell, Health Program Specialist, presented on the status of WET program.

[The Workforce Education and Training Programs \(WET\) Update presentation is hereby incorporated as Attachment V.](#)

AGENDA ITEM 16: Medical Service Study Areas (MSSA) Guidelines Project

Hovik Khosrovian presented on the status of the MSSA Guidelines project.

[The Medical Service Study Areas \(MSSA\) Guidelines Project presentation is hereby incorporated as Attachment W.](#)

AGENDA ITEM 17: General Public Comment

- Recommend that the Policy meetings move to July or August to accommodate residency programs that orient new residents in June.
- Consider current economic environment when making funding decisions and encourage maintaining stability.
- Appreciate the flexibility of the Commission and of OSHPD staff. The meeting materials were effective and supported discussion.

AGENDA ITEM 18: Future Agenda Items

Commission discussed and recommended the following agenda items:

- Consider more points for clinical training sites in AUN where residents spend most of their time.
- Decide data reporting process for graduates with multiple practice sites.
- Present scoring impacts when prioritizing URM residents or graduates.
- Revise scoring methodology for Criterion 1.1 Training sites
- Provide analysis of scoring options for programs that don't have graduate data.
- Outcome Measures:
 - Status of Distribution of flyer to foundations.
 - Develop new measures
 - Revise existing measures
 - Develop new display methods
 - Tie funding recommendations (impact of funding decisions on outcomes)
- Consider scoring on fellowships for graduate data and number of patients seen for Criterion 2.2.
- Discuss definition of practicing primary care and integrate into scoring criteria.
- Allocation of funding for THC and options for funding 2020 and future capitation.
- Discuss data fund allocation for PCR and FNP/PA.
- Refine Mental Health and Team culture topics and set expectations for presenting programs.
- Provide information where programs may have not met contract criteria (how programs spend funds).
- Provide legal guidance on the enforceability of grant guidelines
- Provide an update on the progress of the RN Comprehensive Policy Review Subcommittee and discuss the scope of the policy review.
- Scoring for training sites in Severity of AUN.

ADJOURN MEETING

The meeting adjourned at 2:10 p.m. on June 25, 2020.