



2020 West El Camino Avenue, Suite 800
Sacramento, CA 95833
hcai.ca.gov



Meeting Minutes

SEPTEMBER 6-7, 2023 CALIFORNIA HEALTH WORKFORCE EDUCATION AND TRAINING COUNCIL (Council)

Members of the Council

Rehman Attar, MPH
Audrey Dow, MA
Kathryn Dresslar
Katherine Flores, MD
Kevin Grumbach, MD
Catherine Kennedy, RN
Judith Liu, RN MSN
Roger Liu, PhD
Deena McRae, MD
Nader Nadershahi, DDS,
MBA, EdD
Raul Ramirez
Cedric Rutland, MD
Sandra Sanchez, MBA
Abby Snay, M.Ed.
Van Ton-Quinlivan, MBA
Vernita Todd, MBA

HCAI Director

Elizabeth Landsberg

HCAI Staff

Jean-Paul Buchanan
Jalaunda Granville
Hovik Khosrovian

**Wednesday, September 6, 2023
Meeting Minutes Day 1**

AGENDA ITEM 1: Call to Order

Facilitator: Van Ton-Quinlivan, Chair opened the meeting at 10 a.m.

AGENDA ITEM 2: Swearing in of New Council Member

Facilitator: Jean-Paul Buchanan, Attorney, HCAI

Dr. Deena McRae sworn in as a new member to replace Dr. Carrie Byington.

AGENDA ITEM 3: Introduction of Council Member and Roll Call

Facilitator: Van Ton-Quinlivan, Chair, and Charise Frisch, HCAI Staff

Dr. Deena McRae introduced herself. Charise Frisch conducted the roll call, confirming the presence of council members. Quorum confirmed.

AGENDA ITEM 4: Update and Approval of March 1 and 2, 2023 Meeting Minutes

Facilitator: Van Ton-Quinlivan, Council Chair

Minutes approval was tabled until day 2 due to technical issues

AGENDA ITEM 5: Approval of June 7, 2023 Meeting Minutes

Facilitator: Van Ton-Quinlivan, Council Chair

Minutes approval was tabled until day 2 due to technical issues

AGENDA ITEM 6: HCAI Director Remarks

Facilitator: Elizabeth Landsberg, Director, HCAI

Update the Council on the Governor's FY 2023-24 budget and HCAI activities.

Scott Christman Introduced Sharmil Shah as the new Assistant Deputy Director for Health Workforce Development and announced the appointment of Libby Abbott as the new Deputy Director for the Office of Health Workforce Development, while highlighting Libby Abbott's background and experience in health workforce development and welcoming Libby Abbott to the council meeting.

Scott Christman discussed the FY 2023-24 budget.

- Highlighted continued funding support for health workforce programs and mentioned \$30 million from opioid settlement funds for the Naloxone Access Initiative.
- Discussed the distressed hospital loan program and its purpose to prevent hospital closures. The program awarded no-interest loans to 17 hospitals and noted that workforce shortages and high labor costs were common issues contributing to financial distress in hospitals.

Other Updates

- Introduced the Healthcare Payments Data (HPD) snapshot and announced future data product plans within the Office of Information Services.
- OHCA detailed efforts to curb healthcare spending growth, with a focus on cost-

quality balance and partnerships for workforce stability and quality monitoring, including upcoming healthcare spending targets.

- Marked the 50th anniversary of the Song-Brown Healthcare Workforce Training Act, highlighting its achievements in healthcare workforce diversity and impact on underserved communities.
- Released a celebratory video on the Song-Brown Commission's 50-year legacy, featuring testimonies from previous recipients of funding on the program's support for family medicine and primary care, underscoring its crucial role in improving healthcare access.

Council Member Comments on Agenda Item 6

Dr. Katherine Flores shared her appreciation for Song-Brown and its role in her career. Expressed gratitude for the allocation of funds for distressed hospitals and suggested collaboration with the Department of Education to train students in Naloxone use and requested specific allocations for different workforce programs in the 23-24 budget.

Catherine Kennedy shared her experience on the Workforce Commission and highlighted the importance of resources for rural communities and recognized the impact of Song-Brown on underserved communities and primary care initiatives.

AGENDA ITEM 7: HCAI Workforce Programs and Recommendations Updates

Facilitator: Hovik Khosrovian, Acting Deputy Director, Health Workforce Development, HCAI

The Council reviewed progress in workforce budget and program activities, highlighting successful initiatives like the Train New Trainer program, which offers psychiatric training scholarships to healthcare professionals, focusing on underserved communities. Updated various programs, including the Health Professions Pathways Program (HPPP), Caring4Cal, and the Reproductive Health Access Initiative. Discussed the integration of scholarship and loan repayment programs, streamlining application processes for healthcare scholarships, and the Community Health Worker and Promotoras(es), Representatives Certificate Process was emphasized for workforce expansion. Presented recent funding and budget updates, noting reinstated funding for nursing initiatives, community health workers, the Song-Brown program, and addiction medicine fellowships. Also presented on progress in expanding nursing support and behavioral health scholarship programs.

AGENDA ITEM 8: General Public Comment

There were no public comments.

AGENDA ITEM 9: What Influences Medical Students and Residents to Choose a Career in Primary Care

Presenter: Diane Rittenhouse, Senior Fellow, Mathematica

Presentation Summary:

Diane Rittenhouse presented on the factors influencing medical students' career

choices, detailing how demographics, mentorship, the environment of medical schools, financial burdens, and lifestyle expectations impact these decisions. She underscored the tendency of students to shy away from primary care due to high debt and the perceived benefits of specialties such as radiology and dermatology. Rittenhouse proposed solutions including financial support, early exposure and mentorship programs, and accelerated medical education pathways to foster interest in primary care. The presentation concluded with an emphasis on a comprehensive approach, advocating for support from early education through medical training to address issues like burnout and financial stress in the medical profession.

Council Member Insights on Primary Care Shortage

- **Sandra Sanchez:** stated the importance of starting early in middle school and high school to promote the idea of a career in primary care, mentioning the need for loan forgiveness opportunities and mentorship in communities where students are studying. She also highlighted programs like Song-Brown, which incentivize students and institutions to create opportunities for primary care.
- **Kevin Grumbach:** shared some of the challenges of increasing primary care physicians in California, mentioning that shaping institutional culture and exposing students to primary care may not be enough. He stated that the primary issue is compensation and the conditions of work, as there is a significant income disparity between primary care and other medical specialties. He proposed that the Office of Healthcare Affordability led efforts to increase investment in primary care and set benchmarks for funding.
- **Abby Snay:** recommended focus on the demand side of primary care. She suggested that the council should endorse the Office of Healthcare Affordability's efforts to increase investment in primary care, also mentioning the importance of expanding allied health and team-based care.
- **Catherine Kennedy:** shared her personal experience as a nurse and the importance of creating excitement around primary care careers, especially in underserved populations, also highlighting the need for mentors and support for students who may not have the highest grades but have a passion for primary care.
- **Vernita Todd:** agreed with the previous comments and disclosed her experience as a community-based provider and highlighted the systemic issues that hinder primary care recruitment and retention, including overwhelming workloads and the lack of resources. She suggested addressing the systemic issues collaboratively with other state agencies.
- **Katherine Flores:** stated the importance of exposing students to primary care at an early age, possibly even in K-12 education. She recommended creating programs that make primary care exciting for young individuals, and suggested monitoring the outcomes of Song-Brown program funding to ensure that primary care providers stay in the field.
- **Roger Liu:** stated the need for targeted support for individuals who have a demonstrated commitment to serving underserved communities. He mentioned that some students are passionate about primary care, and it's essential to invest

in those who are dedicated to the field and recommended creating support networks for these individuals.

- **Rehman Attar:** stated that CSU's better representation in the medical schools, and early pipeline is key to get students to want to go into PC.
- **Van Ton-Quinlivan:** the chair thanked all council members for their insights and noted the global nature of the primary care shortage issue and mentioned the importance of finding incentives for retention and supporting primary care teams. Also, acknowledged the diversity of perspectives among council members and the need for collaborative solutions.

Lunch Break

The meeting reconvened for the next topic at 1:55 PM.

AGENDA ITEM 10: Accelerated Education and Training Programs

Moderator: Sunita Mutha, Director, Healthforce Center at UCSF

A panel of experts will discuss how to scale and advance accelerated health professional education and training programs to produce health professionals more quickly.

Accelerated Education and Training Programs

This topic was led with a quick introduction of the moderator's role and described the panel as a group focused on research, the policy to support workforce changes and to build capacity, particularly around leadership.

Three main objectives for discussion:

- 1- Highlight existing programs that accelerate professional education and training in California.
- 2- Understand from these programs, the challenges to scale and to spread these types of programs.
- 3- How to introduce this learning to HCAI and Workforce Development Division to scale, spread and invest in other accelerated programs.

Panelists:

Tonya Fancher, M.D. MPH

Associate Dean, Workforce Innovation and Education Quality Improvement

Director, Center for a Diverse Healthcare Workforce

Vice Chair, Workforce Diversity

Interim Division Head, General Internal Medicine and Bioethics

Professor, General Internal Medicine

University of California Davis School of Medicine

Elaine Musselman, RN, Ph.D, CNE

Associate Professor

Director of the School of Nursing San Francisco State University

Presentation Summary:

The presentations highlighted the success and potential of accelerated education and training programs in both nursing and medical schools, and that the programs have shown positive outcomes in terms of attracting students, increasing workforce capacity, and addressing specialty and geographic imbalances. The key barriers to expanding these programs include faculty and clinical placement shortages, as well as financial constraints. However, there was also an emphasis on the importance of partnerships, selection processes, and ongoing support for students in sustaining and scaling these programs. Overall, the discussions highlighted the value of these programs in meeting the healthcare workforce needs and the potential for further expansion and investment in this area.

- **Katherine Flores:** Praised UC Davis for allowing her to modify her fourth-year curriculum for primary care in Fresno. She expressed appreciation for the Kaiser program's focus and inquired about the possibility of collaborations with FQHCs to expose students to diverse patient populations. Highlighted the importance of interprofessional collaboration in healthcare training and asked Dr. Fancher about the reasons why some students might choose to extend their training beyond the planned duration of their program.
- **Roger Liu:** Emphasized the importance of selecting students passionate about serving their communities, suggesting that such selection can significantly influence the outcomes of training programs.
- **Kevin Grumbach:** Discussed the implications of accelerated programs for HCAI's strategic planning, focusing on their potential benefits for students and the overall healthcare workforce. He pondered whether these programs could address specialty imbalances and geographical distribution issues in medical fields.
- **Deena McRae:** Expressed admiration for Tonya Fancher's work and discussed the need for financial aid, faculty compensation, and staff support in expanding educational programs. She suggested the idea of creating specialized tracks in accelerated programs to address specific healthcare needs.
- **Rahman Attar:** Talked about challenges in accommodating applicants in nursing programs and the implementation of mechanisms for recognizing prior learning and work experience. He stressed the importance of funding and support for mentorship and educational partnerships in the nursing field.

Closing Remarks

Van Ton-Quinlivan expressed the importance to continue supporting and investing in accelerated education and training programs to address the healthcare workforce challenges and ensure the availability of skilled healthcare professionals in the future.

Adjournment

Van Ton-Quinlivan concluded the meeting by thanking panelists, council members, and HCAI staff for their participation and announced the next day's session would begin at 9:00 AM.

Thursday, September 7, 2023
Meeting Minutes Day 2

AGENDA ITEM 1: Call to Order

Facilitator: Van Ton-Quinlivan, Chair opened the meeting at 9:15 a.m. with a recap before the roll call.

Recap

Van Ton-Quinlivan initiates the meeting and mentions that they will do a recap before the roll call. She shares her thoughts on "the art of the possible," highlighting the complexity of the issues and the need for creative solutions. She provides an example from Connecticut where they addressed the nursing pipeline by creating stackable credentials from CNA to LPN to RN, all for credit. The question arises about how to incentivize statewide coverage given the size of the state.

Katheryn Dresslar: mentioned that similar health pathways exist in California where students can earn their CNA during high school. She stated the importance of sharing these opportunities statewide and suggests the need for a centralized information source. Council members and participants discuss various topics related how to incentivize statewide coverage given the size of the state.

Abby Snay: mentioned a joint initiative between HHS, HCAI, and the Labor Agency Workforce for Healthy California and suggested exploring how this collaboration has worked between two state agencies.

AGENDA ITEM 2: Roll Call

Facilitator: Charise Frisch, HCAI Staff
Roll call performed and a quorum established.

AGENDA ITEM 3: Update and Approval of March 1 and 2, 2023 and June 7, 2023 Meeting Minutes

Facilitator: Van Ton-Quinlivan, Council Chair

Meeting minutes were approved for March and June

Motion to approve by Katherine Flores, Seconded by Kevin Grumbach

AGENDA ITEM 3: California's Oral Health Workforce

Presenter: Beth Mertz, Associate Director for Research at Healthforce Presentation on the state of the oral health workforce and overview of related workforce data

Before the presentation, Jalaunda explained HCAI's existing programs related to oral health, including scholarship programs, loan repayment, and Health Professions Pathways Program, and mentions the budget allocation for these programs but also highlights the absence of a set budget.

Presentation Summary:

Beth Mertz presented an overview of the oral health workforce in California, highlighting the state's high per capita supply of dentists, yet noting significant underrepresentation of Hispanic and Black dentists and an average dentist age of 51. The presentation covered various topics including the high cost of dental education, shortages in dental hygienists and assistants, and the low participation of dentists in the Medi-Cal program. Beth Mertz also discussed the dental workforce's demographics and distribution, the challenges in achieving workforce diversity, the impact of COVID-19, and student debt, emphasizing the need for more comprehensive data and policy solutions.

- **Nader Nadershahi:** Discussed the primary care focus in oral health education and the need for prevention. Emphasized the importance of integrating oral health with overall health and behavioral health for patient-centered care. Highlighted the need for diversity in healthcare recruitment, especially from underrepresented backgrounds. Mentioned the potential of mobile health units to provide dental care in schools.
- **Roger Liu:** Stressed the importance of having healthcare professionals who reflect the communities they serve. Advocated for engaging underrepresented dentists in recruitment and mentorship, especially through FQHCs.
- **Katherine Flores:** Emphasized the need for inclusive health profession programs that encompass various fields including oral and mental health, stressing the importance of exposure to these fields from an early age.
- **Van Ton-Quinlivan:** Highlighted the need for integrated, holistic approaches in healthcare education and career awareness to better serve diverse communities.
- **Abby Snay:** Discussed the challenges in the dental assistant workforce, including workplace dissatisfaction and the impact of COVID-19. Shared insights on successful on-the-job training programs for dental assistants and the potential expansion of these programs in partnership with the California Dental Association.
- **Sandra Sanchez:** Offered to provide detailed information on dental programs within the community college system, including bachelor's degrees in dental hygiene and apprenticeship programs. Highlighted the focus on livable wage opportunities and the expansion of dental hygiene programs.
- **Rehman Attar:** Expressed concerns about the high debt burden for dental students and the barriers this creates for underrepresented students. Questioned the effectiveness of the current pathway to becoming a dentist and the impact of clinical training locations on students' future practice choices.

AGENDA ITEM 4: Oral Health Workforce Discussion

Facilitator: Jalaunda Granville, Chief, Policy Section, Health Workforce Development, HCAI

Group discussion on how HCAI can expand the capacity to train and increase the diversity and equity of oral health providers over one to two years.

- **Nader Nadershahi:** Introduction and excitement about the discussion's focus on healthcare integration, as well as an emphasis on person-centered care and the importance of oral health in overall health. Mention of financial challenges faced by dental schools and disparities in gender data and provided suggestions for pilot programs, including reimbursement for care at schools and collaborative care training models. Issued a proposal to leverage resources for outreach, scholarships, loan repayments, and faculty recruitment, with a focus on diversity in the dental workforce and increasing numbers in dental hygiene and dental assisting.
- **Raul Ramirez:** Recognition of demographic trends and the need to diversify dental professions.
- **Deena McRae:** Proposal for scholarships to incentivize advanced degrees and increase faculty, and mentioned the DDS Aspire program and funding for dental students in underserved communities.
- **Katherine Flores:** Emphasis on addressing dental school curriculum and comparing it to successful primary care programs.

AGENDA ITEM 5: General Public Comment

Facilitator: Van Ton-Quinlivan, Chair

Individual stressed support for programmatic funding for oral health pathway programs and suggest the creation of an oral health apprenticeship program to expand funding for underserved areas. They committed to working with HCAI to promote opportunities and provide feedback.

Lunch Break

The meeting was adjourned, and the attendees were informed about the lunch break.

AGENDA ITEM 6: Nursing Workforce: Building a Strong Foundation

Presenter: Anna Sutton, Consultant, HCAI

Presentation on foundational steps and innovative programs to retain and increase the nursing workforce.

Presentation Summary:

Anna Sutton presented on the Nursing Workforce Strategy. She highlighted the significance of the situation, background, assessment and recommendation communication tool in nursing, underscoring the need for support in nursing education, mentorship, apprenticeships, and funding to sustain and enhance nursing programs,

and emphasized a focus on direct care and workforce studies. The session included discussions on addressing the faculty shortage in nursing through increased salaries, incentives, and employer-educator relationships, and tackled the challenges faced by working adults in nursing education, proposing standardized prerequisites and learn-and-earn experiences. The discussion also showcased innovative models like the Summer Health Institute for Nursing Exploration and Success programs and emphasized the importance of apprenticeship programs and employer-educator partnerships.

- **Katherine Flores:** Suggested synthesizing past data with current recommendations for success in nursing. Raised concerns about the challenges new nurses face in finding jobs and the need for integrated pathway programs that don't isolate nursing from other health professions.
- **Roger Liu:** Shared his experience in establishing a nursing school in partnership with an FQHC, emphasizing the importance of practical training and mentorship. Suggested a model similar to the adverse childhood experiences screening rollout for alignment and shared learning.
- **Sandra Sanchez:** Announced an upcoming RFA for apprenticeship programs in healthcare, highlighting the challenge of getting employers to participate. Discussed the complexity of nursing pay due to locally negotiated agreements and suggested exploring incentives for attracting individuals to teaching professions.
- **Van Ton-Quinlivan:** Questioned the prerequisites required for nursing and allied health professions, especially for working adults. Suggested exploring learn-and-earn models to facilitate career advancement from lower-level healthcare jobs to higher-level positions.
- **Deena McRae:** Echoed the importance of not financially penalizing educators and discussed the need for rewarding career paths in education. Mentioned UC Davis' efforts to translate the California Medicine Scholars program to nursing, aiming to create a continuous pathway across various stages of healthcare education.

AGENDA ITEM 7: General Public Comment

Facilitator: Van Ton-Quinlivan, Chair

- One participant shared their experience with receiving grants for nursing programs and emphasized the importance of strategies for success, particularly in addressing family, finance, and academic challenges.

AGENDA ITEM 8: Adjourn Day Two Meeting

Facilitator: Van Ton-Quinlivan, Chair

Meeting was adjourned.