



2020 West El Camino Avenue, Suite 800
Sacramento, CA 95833
hcai.ca.gov



Meeting Minutes

December 2023 CALIFORNIA HEALTH WORKFORCE EDUCATION AND TRAINING COUNCIL (Council)

Members of the Council

Rehman Attar, MPH
Audrey Dow, MA
Kathryn Dresslar
Katherine Flores, MD
Kevin Grumbach, MD
Catherine Kennedy, RN
Judith Liu, RN MSN
Roger Liu, PhD
Deena McRae, MD
Nader Nadershahi, DDS,
MBA, EdD
Raul Ramirez
Cedric Rutland, MD
Sandra Sanchez, MBA
Abby Snay, M.Ed.
Van Ton-Quinlivan, MBA
Vernita Todd, MBA

HCAI Director

Elizabeth Landsberg

HCAI Staff

Jean-Paul Buchanan
Jalaunda Granville
Hovik Khosrovian

December 2023
Meeting Minutes Day 1

AGENDA ITEM 1: Call to Order

Facilitator: Van Ton-Quinlivan, Chair

The meeting was called to order by Chair Van Ton-Quinlivan on Wednesday, December 6, 2023, 9:00 a.m. at 2020 West El Camino Avenue Conference Room 900 Sacramento, CA 95835.

Before officially starting, she welcomed everyone, mentioned the proximity to the holidays, and expressed gratitude for the new seating arrangement. She acknowledged the staff's efforts in implementing the change.

Additionally, Van informed the attendees about a change in agenda sequence, with item number six being addressed first due to the need for a quorum. She also announced the replacement of Sandra Sanchez by Rebecca Ruan-O'Shaughnessy to represent the California Community Colleges, with Rebecca being unable to attend due to illness.

AGENDA ITEM 2: Swearing in of New Council Member

Facilitator: Van Ton-Quinlivan, Chair

Van announced that Rebecca Ruan-O'Shaughnessy will be sworn in at the next meeting. No new members were sworn in during this meeting session.

AGENDA ITEM 3: Introduction of New Council Member and Roll Call

Facilitator: Van Ton-Quinlivan, Chair, and Charise Frisch, HCAI Staff

Van welcomed Libby Abbott to her first HCAI meeting in person and expressed anticipation for her contributions.

Charise Frisch conducted the roll call, though, quorum was not yet met.

AGENDA ITEM 4: HCAI Director Remarks

Facilitator: Elizabeth Landsberg, Director, HCAI

Elizabeth Landsberg introduced Libby, the new Deputy Director of Health Workforce Development, highlighting her extensive experience in global health policy.

AGENDA ITEM 5: HCAI Workforce Program and Recommendations Update

Facilitator: Libby Abbott, Deputy Director, Health Workforce Development, HCAI

Libby opened the discussion by providing an update on the organizational structure of HCAI's work. The programs will now be categorized into four buckets: Behavioral Health, Nursing, Primary Care, and Oral Health. This shift aims to enhance outcome focus and coherence across a diverse range of programs. She introduced a forthcoming strategy development process, beginning in early 2024, which will focus on the four buckets. Each strategy will address key questions, including defining the end state, identifying pathways to change, assessing current funding, determining partner roles, and identifying any funding gaps.

AGENDA ITEM 6: Appointing New Chair and Vice Chair

Facilitator: Hovik Khosrovian, Senior Policy Advisor, Health Workforce Development, HCAI

Hovik provided an update on the approaching two-year anniversary of the council in March 2024. As per the initial plan introduced in March 2022, a new chair and vice chair is needed. The roles involve guiding meetings, providing feedback, and collaborating on refining agendas.

Nominations:

- Chair: Van Ton-Quinlivan
- Vice Chair: Nader Nadershahi

Nomination was passed unanimously by committee members.

AGENDA ITEM 7: Research Data Center Update

Facilitator: Eric Neuhauser, Research and Evaluation Section Chief, Health Workforce Development, HCAI

Eric presented an update on the Research Data Center (RDC). The RDC, in development since the passing of AB 133 in 2021, aims to be a central repository for health workforce and education data. Eric highlighted the diverse data sources, including state licensing boards, surveys, certified entities, and higher education data, integrated into the RDC's data warehouse. He then displayed four recently released dashboards, emphasizing key findings on the race/ethnicity and language diversity of California's health workforce. Eric outlined future plans, including visualizations on workplace settings and detailed race/ethnicity metrics. Council members expressed enthusiasm for the dashboards' insights and emphasized their importance for informed decision-making and targeted interventions.

Council Comments:

- **Abby Snay:** Highlighted the workforce for a healthy California initiative and efforts in messaging and outreach. Suggested the need for a common message and emphasized the value of a strategy to push beyond traditional approaches.
- **Roger Liu:** Addressed the challenge of language standards and assessments for healthcare professionals, especially those proficient in Spanish. Inquired about the data reporting process and suggested exploring functional standards.
- **Nader Nadershahi:** Appreciated the presentation, echoed appreciation for the work, and raised questions about leveraging artificial intelligence for efficiency. Also suggested exploring accrediting bodies for additional data on healthcare programs.
- **Raul Ramirez:** Commended Eric for the presentation and sought clarification on the timeline of the data. Raised questions about evaluating program effectiveness and connecting dashboard insights to actionable steps.
- **Public member:** Shared insights as a recipient of Healthcare Professions Pathways Program (HPPP) funding, expressing surprise at the limited survey questions received. Encouraged leveraging recipients to collect missing data

and suggested considering training opportunities for employed clinicians to enhance language competence.

These comments and questions reflect the diverse perspectives and considerations presented during the Research Data Center Update, covering areas such as language proficiency, coordinated communication efforts, AI utilization, program evaluation, and training opportunities for healthcare professionals.

AGENDA ITEM 8: Approval of September Meeting Minutes

Facilitator: Van Ton-Quinlivan, Council Chair

Meeting minutes were approved for September.

- **Nader Nadershahi:** Motioned to approve the minutes.
- **Roger Liu:** Seconded the motion.

AGENDA ITEM 9: Diversifying the Physician and Nursing Workforce in California

Presenters: Diane Rittenhouse, Senior Fellow, Mathematica and Hovik Khosrovian, Senior Policy Advisor, Health Workforce Development, HCAI

Diane presented policy recommendations focused on diversifying the physician and nursing workforce in California. The presentation began with gratitude to Hovik for facilitating the collaboration and thanked HCAI for engaging in this effort. Diane emphasized the project's immediate objective was to produce specific, actionable policy recommendations at the education and training level to support racially and ethnically diverse medical and nursing workforces in California.

The key recommendations presented by Diane included:

- Providing flexible financial support tied to individuals, including unconditional grants, scholarships, loan repayment, and stipends for living and non-academic expenses.
- Funding successful programs along the education pathway, with a focus on mentoring programs, pre-health academic enrichment programs, post-baccalaureate programs, and regional hubs.
- Sponsoring convenings to facilitate innovation, scaling, and networking, such as pre-Health Advising Academies and annual academic advising convenings.
- Supporting evaluation and research efforts, including qualitative research on barriers to workforce diversity and incentivizing data collection and evaluation infrastructure.
- Collecting and making meaningful data publicly available, focusing on workforce diversity at the community level and highlighting institutions with an effective record of accomplishment for diversity.
- Advocating for broader policy changes through this council, such as holistic admission processes, prioritizing graduate medical education funding, advocating for Medi-Cal payment parity, and standardizing prerequisite courses.

Hovik expressed appreciation for Diane's work and Mathematica's support,

highlighting the importance of their recommendations. He emphasized HCAI's overarching goal of creating a diverse and equitable healthcare workforce. The presentation delved into the financial support for individuals, with insights into HCAI's existing efforts, such as scholarships, stipends, and loan payment programs. The discussion touched on racial and ethnic diversity in nursing and physician workforce, with a commitment to extending these considerations to other professions like behavioral health and oral health. Future considerations included the possibility of implementing stipends for living expenses and guaranteeing continued support for students who have already been awarded scholarships or loan payments.

Council Comments:

- **Abby Snay:** Highlighted the need for a holistic approach, emphasizing that addressing diversity requires strategies beyond just the educational pipeline. She also raised the importance of incorporating cultural humility and diversity training into the curriculum to foster a more inclusive healthcare workforce.
- **Elizabeth Landsberg:** Underscored the significance of addressing the root causes of disparities and the need for ongoing data collection and evaluation to ensure the effectiveness of interventions. She inquired about strategies to engage private entities and employers in fostering diversity.
- **Deena McRae:** Commended the comprehensive presentation and stressed the importance of achieving diversity across all healthcare professions. She emphasized the need for diversity across specialties and regions, highlighting the role of faculty diversity and supportive networks in recruitment and retention.
- **Kevin Grumbach:** Acknowledged the challenge of addressing broader societal factors contributing to health workforce disparities. He recommended focusing on high-yield interventions, such as post-baccalaureate programs and increasing capacity for health career advising, particularly in the California State University system. He shared insights about the significance of post-bacc programs and emphasized the value of program-to-program handoffs to support students effectively.
- **Roger Liu:** Reflected on his 25 years of work in this field, expressing the need for innovative solutions and suggesting the creation of programs or fellowships to nurture passionate individuals committed to diversity in healthcare.
- **Raul Ramirez:** Raised a question about gathering input from students directly, both successful and those who faced challenges, to understand their perspectives and improve support mechanisms.
- **Kathryn Dresslar:** Appreciated the comprehensive plan and suggested conducting exit interviews with students who did not continue in healthcare careers to identify challenges and successes.
- **Diane Rittenhouse:** Expressed gratitude for the council's engagement and emphasized the value of taking immediate action to address workforce challenges.
- **Hovik Khosrovian:** Thanked the council for their feedback and expressed readiness to take their suggestions back for further consideration.

AGENDA ITEM 10: General Public Comment

Facilitator: Van Ton-Quinlivan, Chair

Public Comments:

- Public member from the California Nurses Association advocated for prioritizing support for community college nursing programs, specifically the associate degree in nursing (ADN) as an affordable and accessible pathway to nursing practice.
- Public member from the California Primary Care Association emphasized the importance of retaining trainees in areas of unmet need, supported the Grow Your Own model, and encouraged exploring strategies to increase graduate medical education (GME) funding for programs serving underserved communities.

Lunch Break

AGENDA ITEM 11: Allied Health Workforce

Presenter: Susan Chapman, Professor, UCSF School of Nursing

Susan presented on the Allied Health Workforce. She highlighted the diversity and roles of allied health professionals, emphasizing the challenges in obtaining comprehensive workforce data. Susan discussed opportunities for growth, such as expanding programs in public educational institutions, supporting internships, and addressing the need for career development within these professions. She also touched on specific allied health occupations in California, pointing out critical shortages in areas like clinical laboratory science and the importance of partnerships with employers and regional workforce development.

AGENDA ITEM 12: Allied Health Workforce Discussion

Facilitator: Chris Perry, State Policy Unit Manager, Policy Section, Health Workforce Development, HCAI

Following Susan Chapman's presentation on the Allied Health Workforce, the Council engaged in a group discussion on how HCAI can expand the capacity to train and increase the diversity and equity of allied health providers in the primary care workforce over the next one to two years.

Discussion Questions:

- What can HCAI and the state do to expand the capacity to train Allied Health providers over the next one to three years?
- How can HCAI leverage existing partnerships?
- What gaps are there in the current scope of Allied Health workforce initiatives that HCAI can address?
- How can HCAI fund team-based care?
- How can HCAI use funding to support Community Health Centers?
- What strategies can the Council identify that can lead to an increase in Allied

Health workforce diversity and equity?

Council Comments:

- **Abby Snay:** Highlighted initiatives and partnerships totaling over \$300 million for training allied health professionals.
- **Roger Liu:** Emphasized the importance of employer connections and growth among current employees. He mentioned the potential misuse of allied health roles as a fallback and the importance of presenting them as entry points for career advancement.
- **Kevin Grumbach:** Raised the issue of career pathways and the importance of addressing attrition and advocated for sustainable funding and discussed the inadequacy of the Employment Training Panel's eligibility criteria.
- **Nader Nadershahi:** Raised the need to expand training sites for allied health individuals, especially in challenging disciplines.
- **Libby Abbott:** Mentioned the interest in exploring value-based care opportunities and pointed out the upcoming Primary Care Strategy expected in late 2024 or early 2025.
- **Deena Shin McRae:** Raised questions about integrating AI into the daily activities of allied health professionals and mentioned the impact of SB 525 on wages and its potential effects on recruitment.
- **Susan Chapman:** Emphasized holistic thinking, linking workforce development with payment and resource aspects, and advocated for apprenticeship programs, champions in K-12, and non-traditional pathways for diverse students.

Recommendations:

- **Sustainable Funding:** Focus on securing sustainable funding for allied health programs, addressing limitations of existing funding sources.
- **Career Pathways and Retention:** Develop strategies to address attrition and build clear career pathways for allied health professionals, considering upward mobility.
- **Value-Based Care:** Explore opportunities in value-based care and team-based care models, leveraging allied health professionals.
- **Partnerships and Collaboration:** Strengthen collaborations with educational institutions, community colleges, and healthcare employers to enhance training opportunities.
- **AI Integration:** Investigate the potential role of allied health professionals in integrating AI into daily healthcare activities, reducing administrative burdens.
- **Minimum Wage Impact:** Assess the impact of SB 525's \$25 minimum per hour wage on recruitment strategies and overall dynamics in the allied health workforce.
- **Systematic Approach to Roles:** Develop a systematic approach to roles within primary care settings, defining responsibilities and scope of practice.
- **Training Enhancement:** Support on-the-job training initiatives for allied health providers to enhance skills and empower proactive roles in primary care.
- **Stackable Credentials:** Consider developing stackable credentials for Allied

Health roles, allowing progression based on formal education and practical experience.

- Community Engagement: Establish a subgroup to engage with community health centers, addressing challenges posed by alternative payment models and value-based care.
- Funding for Team-Based Training: Explore funding opportunities to facilitate team-based training in primary care settings.
- Prototype Training Models: Consider prototyping training models to adapt existing healthcare professionals to team-based and value-based care.
- Addressing Payment Models: Recognize the role of payment models in facilitating team-based care, aligning training initiatives with alternative payment models.
- Coordinated Statewide Campaign: Develop a campaign to promote healthcare career opportunities, focusing on underrepresented communities.
- Apprenticeship Programs: Establish apprenticeship programs for allied health professions, modeled after successful initiatives in other sectors.
- Champions and Awareness: Encourage the presence of champions to inspire interest and awareness of allied health careers.
- Diverse Opportunities: Integrate workforce development initiatives to offer a spectrum of opportunities for advancement, supporting non-traditional pathways.
- Private For-Profit Schools: Investigate and address the impact of private for-profit schools on the accessibility and affordability of allied health education.
- Credit-for-Prior-Learning: Explore the creation of credit-for-prior-learning mechanisms to recognize and accelerate educational pathways of individuals with existing skills.
- Variations in Job Quality and Wages: Tackle variations in job quality and wages by focusing training efforts on settings that offer competitive compensation for allied health roles.

AGENDA ITEM 13: General Public Comment

Facilitator: Van Ton-Quinlivan, Chair

- One participant, from the Labor Agency, shared insights about successful programs for nonclinical roles within healthcare, emphasizing the importance of coaching and navigation for individuals transitioning into allied health roles.
- Another participant raised concerns about state licensure programs not allowing paid work experience for clinical preceptorships, particularly in respiratory therapy and radiology tech programs.
- Libby Abbott acknowledged the challenge and mentioned that the regulations around clinical hours being paid are determined by the board, expressing awareness of the issue.

AGENDA ITEM 14: Adjourn Meeting

Facilitator: Van Ton-Quinlivan, Chair

Van concluded the meeting, officially adjourning the meeting and reminding attendees of the upcoming two-day session scheduled for March 13th and 14th.